
RAVENSDOWN RESOURCE CONSENT RENEWAL PROJECT**TECHNICAL FOCUS GROUP****MEETING 2 MINUTES - FINAL¹**

DATE Tuesday 18 May 2021
TIME 12:00pm - 4:00pm
VENUE Kohupatiki Marae, Kohupatiki Road, Clive

IN ATTENDANCE

Andrew Torrens - Ravensdown	Aki Paipper - Kohupātiki Marae
Helen Hurring - Ravensdown	Margi McGuire - Kohupātiki Marae
Stephen Daysh - Mitchell Daysh	Taylor Materoa - Kohupātiki Marae
Anita Anderson - Mitchell Daysh	Nigel Halpin - BioRich
Jamie Thompson - Ravensdown	Sam Robinson - Ravensdown Customer
Marlane Harmer - Ravensdown	Matthew Brady - DOC
Ngaire Phillips - Streamlined Environmental	Senitra Nathan-Marsh - DOC
Richard Chilton - Tonkin+Taylor	Reynold Ball - HBDHB
Francesca Kelly - Environmental Medicine Ltd (linked via teams)	Tom Kay - Forest & Bird (linked via teams) (part of meeting)
Jack Blunden - HBRC	Fred Sugden - Taradale High School
Malcom Miller - HBRC	Madison Milley - Taradale High School
Tania Diack - HBRC	Elliot Morell - Taradale High School
Shane Kelly (Coast and Catchment) - HBRC Technical Advisor (linked via teams)	Shade Smith - Ngāti Kahungunu Iwi Inc (part of meeting)
Kyle Christensen (Kyle Christensen Consulting) - HBRC Technical Advisor (linked via teams)	Jenny Mauger - Kahungunu ki Te Matau a Māui, Gazetted Customary Fisheries Rohe Moana

APOLOGIES

Andrew Curtis (PDP) - HBRC Technical Advisor	Chad Tareha - Ngāti Pārau Hapū (Present for Powhiri)
Tania Eden - Te Taiwhenua o Te Whanganui-a- Orutū	Ami Coughlan - Fish and Game
Bruce Wills - Ravensdown (Director)	

¹ Confirmed at TFG Meeting 3, 16 July 2021.

1. Powhiri and Lunch

The (Technical Focus Group) TFG members were welcomed onto Kohupatiki Marae.

2. Karakia, Opening and Introductions

- The following members attending the meeting for the first time introduced themselves to the group.
 - Jenny Mauger - Kahungunu ki Te Matau a Māui, Co-Chair Gazetted Customary Fisheries Rohe Moana. Attending to support the mana whenua hapū. Jenny provided a background to her experience and family history in the area.
 - Madison Milley - Taradale High School student. Attending to gain knowledge from the process.
 - Elliot Morell - Taradale High School student. Attending to see the process and learn and absorb knowledge.
 - Fred Sugden - Taradale High School student. Here to learn and understand how this discharge affects our waterways.
 - Kyle Christensen - HBRC Technical Advisor for stormwater and river engineering.

3. Draft Minutes - TFG Meeting 1 15 April 2021

- Stephen asked the group for any comments or questions on the draft minutes of Meeting 1 and addressed each of the meeting action as follows:
 1. TFG representation
 - Horticulture representative (Jamie) - Danielle Adsett from NZ Apple and Pears was unable to come. In discussion with Bostock NZ regarding attendance.
 - HBRC Asset Management Team (Tania) – Kyle Christensen attending.
 - Shade Smith and NKII - (Stephen, Margi). Shade was hoping to attend TFG2 after he has finished at another meeting.
 - Taradale High School representative (Andrew) – three students attending - Fred, Madie and Elliot.
 2. Webpage - Ravensdown is working on getting the website ready to go live in the next week. Will include TFG meeting minutes.
 3. TFG Terms of Reference - finalised. Will be added to the website.
 4. Consent compliance - Webpage to include HBRC Compliance Monitoring Reports.
 5. Presentation on Ravensdown's research projects – not being presented at TFG Meeting 2 due to time constraints. Jamie noted that there is a Horticulture Field Day in early June and invited TFG members to attend.
- The minutes of first meeting of the TFG, dated 15 April 2021, were confirmed as a true and correct record of the meeting.
 - Moved - Malcolm Miller***
 - Seconded - Matt Brady***
 - Carried unanimously***
- The meeting minutes will be finalised and attached to the minutes of meeting two (Attachment 1) and added to the project website.

Agreed Action 1: Helen to send the TFG members an invitation to the Horticulture Field Day

4. Presentation - Aki Paipper, Kohupātiki Marae

See the project website for a copy of the presentation.

- Aki provided the group background to the Ngāti Hori and Kohupātiki Marae whanau's historical connection to the lower Karamu Stream and Waitangi Estuary, outlining concerns about the degradation of the waterway, the work that has been done to improve the state of the catchment through Operation Patiki² and their involvement in processes such as the TANK Plan Change process.

5. Presentation - Dr Ngaire Phillips, Streamlined Environmental Ltd

See the project website for a copy of the presentation.

- Ngaire summarised the baseline monitoring and investigations being undertaken by Ravensdown on the current stormwater and process water discharge to the Awatoto Drain (and the ultimate receiving environment of the Tūtaekūri River and Waitangi Estuary).
- It was confirmed that Ngaire's work to date did not look forward to what the replacement discharge permit would involve. This will be determined in consultation with the TFG after technical advice. Ngaire will then progress a detailed assessment of ecological and water quality effects based on the chosen discharge strategy.
- TFG members asked questions and provided comment on the following matters. *These will be considered by Ravensdown and the technical team in the preparation of the baseline and future assessment reports.*
 - Current consent compliance and consent limits.
 - Location of the current discharge relative to upstream and downstream sampling sites, the monitoring programme, and flow of the surrounding drains.
 - Historical overflows from the Ravensdown stormwater.
 - Origin of fluoride in the process.
 - Dispersion of the dye used in the the dye study.
- Stephen noted that the baseline assessment will be used in the consideration of the discharge strategy for the new consent which Ravensdown will ask for feedback on from the TFG members at the next meeting.

6. Presentation - Richard Chilton, Tonkin + Taylor

See the project website for a copy of the presentation.

- Richard provided an overview of the current discharges to air from the Napier works and responded to questions and comments from the TFG members.
- The same process of determining the new air discharge strategy as discussed previously will be applied to the air discharge but recognising that there is only one possible receiving environment and plant the air discharge relates to.
- TFG members asked questions and provided comment on the following matters. *These will be considered by Ravensdown and the technical team in the preparation of the baseline and future assessment reports.*

² Also see the Ngati Hori Freshwater Management Plan <https://www.hbrc.govt.nz/assets/Document-Library/Publications/Tangata-Whenua/Ngati-Hori-Freshwater-Resources-Management-Plan.pdf>

- Ability to shut plant down if discharge conditions are unsuitable.
- Monitoring programme and sampling equipment.
- Odour (SO₂).
- Fugitive emissions from the site.
- Human health effects.
- Modelling methodology.
- Discharge from the proposed single 50m stack.

7. Presentation - Dr Francesca Kelly, Environmental Medicine Limited

See the project website for a copy of the presentation.

- Francesca provided an overview of environmental health effects assessment of the current discharges to air and water from the Napier works.
- TFG members asked questions and provided comment on the following matters. *These will be considered by Ravensdown and the technical team in the finalisation of the baseline and future assessment reports.*
 - Concentration of fluoride in food, water and other products (e.g., toothpaste) vs ambient fluoride associated with the Ravensdown discharge.
 - Accumulation of metals and other contaminants in fish and harvested food.

8. Next meeting

- Stephen noted the technical team are currently reviewing the discharge options for the site and that these will be presented to the TFG at the next meeting in late June and enable discussion and input by the TFG members before a final discharge strategy is settled on.

9. Final Questions and Comments

- Andrew noted that Ravensdown is committed to an open and honest process for the resource consent renewal project and that presentations show that there are a lot of aspects that Ravensdown are doing well with, while improvements are necessary in other areas. Ravensdown accepts the need for improvement, which has included the recent significant investment in new emission control equipment to improve the air discharge from the plant. The team is also looking at the options for the water discharge and how it can be improved as well as potential enhancements to the receiving environment.
- Any questions related to the meetings presentations can be emailed to Helen at helen.hurring@ravensdown.co.nz. Helen will pass these on to the relevant expert.

Meeting Closed at 4:00 pm.

Minutes prepared by Helen Hurring and Anita Anderson

Attachment 1: FINAL Minutes, TFG Meeting 1, 15 April 2021